

**KRIS MAYES**  
**ATTORNEY GENERAL**  
(Firm State Bar No. 14000)

Hayleigh S. Crawford (No. 32326)  
Office of the Arizona Attorney General  
2005 N. Central Avenue  
Phoenix, AZ 85004-1592  
Phone: (602) 542-3333  
Hayleigh.Crawford@azag.gov  
ACL@azag.gov

*Attorneys for Defendant*  
*Arizona Attorney General Kris Mayes*

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**  
**DISTRICT OF ARIZONA**

Arizona Broadcasters Association, et al.,

Plaintiff,

v.

Kris Mayes, in her official capacity as  
Attorney General for the State of  
Arizona, et al.,

Defendants.

Case No: CV-22-01431-PHX-JJT

**STIPULATION REGARDING ENTRY  
OF PERMANENT INJUNCTION AND  
DECLARATORY JUDGMENT**

(Assigned to the Hon. J. John Tuchi)

Plaintiffs filed their Complaint against Defendants seeking a declaratory judgment that A.R.S. § 13-3732 is unconstitutional under the First and Fourteenth Amendments of the United States Constitution and permanently enjoining any enforcement of the statute.

1 Some Defendants have defaulted; the remaining Defendant and Plaintiffs agree to this  
2 Stipulation regarding entry of a Permanent Injunction and Declaratory Judgment to  
3 resolve all non-attorney fees matters in dispute in this action.

4 Specifically, for the reasons set forth on the record at the hearing on Plaintiffs'  
5 request for a Preliminary Injunction, which this Court will treat as a trial on the merits  
6 under Rule 65(a)(2), and in Plaintiffs' Complaint and Motion for Preliminary Injunction,  
7 which Defendants did not challenge on the merits, Plaintiffs Arizona Broadcasters  
8 Association; Arizona Newspapers Association; Fox Television Stations, LLC; Gray  
9 Media Group, Inc. d/b/a KTVK-KPHO and d/b/a KOLD; KPNX-TV Channel 12, a  
10 division of Multimedia Holdings Corp.; National Press Photographers Association;  
11 Phoenix Newspapers, Inc.; Scripps Media, Inc. d/b/a KGUN-TV and d/b/a KNXV-TV;  
12 States Newsroom/Arizona Mirror; Telemundo of Arizona LLC; and American Civil  
13 Liberties Union of Arizona and Defendant Kris Mayes, in her capacity as the Attorney  
14 General of Arizona, hereby stipulate as follows:  
15  
16

17  
18 1. A.R.S. § 13-3732 is unconstitutional as a violation of the First Amendment to the  
19 United States Constitution, as applied to the states through the Fourteenth  
20 Amendment, because:

- 21 a. there is a clearly established right to record law enforcement officers  
22 engaged in the exercise of their official duties, *see, e.g., Askins v. Dep't of*  
23 *Homeland Sec.*, 899 F.3d 1035, 1044 (9th Cir. 2018);  
24 b. the statute imposes a content-based restriction that is subject to strict  
25 scrutiny as it "singles out specific subject matter"—recordings of law  
26 enforcement activities—"for differential treatment," *Reed v. Town of*  
27 *Gilbert*, 576 U.S. 155, 169 (2015); and  
28

1 c. the statute does not survive strict scrutiny because it is not narrowly tailored  
2 or necessary to prevent interference with police officers given other Arizona  
3 laws in effect.

4 2. A.R.S. § 13-3732 is unconstitutional as a violation of the First Amendment to the  
5 United States Constitution, as applied to the states through the Fourteenth  
6 Amendment, because:

7 a. the statute is not a reasonable “time place and manner” restriction, *see Hill*  
8 *v. Colorado*, 530 U.S. 703, 713 (2000); and

9 b. the statute cannot withstand intermediate scrutiny because the law prohibits  
10 or chills a substantial amount of First Amendment protected activity and is  
11 unnecessary to prevent interference with police officers given other Arizona  
12 laws in effect.

13 3. Defendants, and any others acting in concert or participation with them who receive  
14 actual notice of this injunction, are permanently enjoined from enforcing A.R.S.  
15 § 13-3732 against any person or entity, or using an alleged violation of A.R.S. § 13-  
16 3732 as an excuse, justification, or reason to punish or otherwise take or fail to take  
17 any action adverse to the interests of any person or entity.

18 A proposed form of Order accompanies this stipulation. The parties further stipulate and  
19 agree that this Court should retain jurisdiction over this action for the purposes of  
20 construction, modification, and enforcement of the proposed Order.  
21

22 RESPECTFULLY SUBMITTED this 12th day of July, 2023.

23 **KRIS MAYES**  
24 **ATTORNEY GENERAL**

25 By: /s/ Hayleigh S. Crawford

26 Hayleigh S. Crawford  
27 Office of the Arizona Attorney General  
28 2005 N. Central Ave.  
Phoenix, Arizona 85004

*Attorneys for Defendant  
Arizona Attorney General Kris Mayes*

**AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION  
FOUNDATION OF ARIZONA**

By: /s/ K.M. Bell (with permission)

K. M. Bell  
Jared G. Keenan  
3707 North 7th Street, Suite 235  
Phoenix, AZ 85014

**AMERICAN CIVIL LIBERTIES UNION  
FOUNDATION**

Esha Bhandari  
Vera Eidelman  
American Civil Liberties Union Foundation  
125 Broad Street, 18th Floor  
New York, NY 10004

*Attorneys for Plaintiff American Civil  
Liberties  
Union of Arizona*

**BALLARD SPAHR LLP**

By: /s/ Matthew E. Kelley (with permission)

David J. Bodney  
Matthew E. Kelley  
Kennison Lay  
1 East Washington Street, Suite 2300  
Phoenix, AZ 85004-2555

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs Arizona Broadcasters  
Association; Arizona Newspapers  
Association; Fox Television Stations, LLC;  
Gray Media Group, Inc. d/b/a KTVK-KPHO  
and d/b/a KOLD; KPNX-TV Channel 12, a  
division of Multimedia Holdings Corp.;  
National Press Photographers Association;  
Phoenix Newspapers, Inc.; Scripps Media,  
Inc. d/b/a KGUN-TV and d/b/a KNXV-TV;  
States Newsroom/Arizona Mirror; and  
Telemundo of Arizona LLC*